

ITB No. 21-101330 - Kensington Pump Station and Pipeline Project

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Watershed Management

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

Bidder 1: Ruby Collins / \$2,310,667.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 2: _____
Name/Amount

Bidder 3: _____
Name/Amount

Project Amount This Term: \$2,310,667.00

Funding: Renewal & Extension(R&E)

General Enterprise 3 Digit Fund Code _____

CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): A.047-A1

ITB No. No. 21-101330 - Kensington Pump Station and Pipeline Project

Justification:

The justification of the cost evaluation is as follows;

Table 1 represents the cost comparison in each line item for 4 bidders against the Engineer Opinion of Probable Construction Cost (OPCC) which was performed in 2020. The OPCC in 2020 was estimated at a value of \$2,083,454.29. Per the industry standard, the Cost Index Escalation Factor from 2020 to 2021 is 1.07, which escalates the OPCC for 2021 to the value of \$2,228,798.86. The lowest bidder, Ruby Collins, proposed bid cost is \$2,310,667.00, which is 3.54% higher than the OPCC 2021. The OPCC is a conceptual cost estimate based on final construction plans and scope. A true estimated cost can only be determined when all plans and scopes are complete. The 3.54% higher price is well within industry standards, which is plus or minus 5 percent based on final construction plans and scope. Variables that could affect the estimated cost once construction documents are finalized are date of construction, time of year, labor forces, and materials used and associated costs. Currently, it is a very challenging time for construction contractors due to the high price of construction materials, especially metal products such as ductile iron pipe (DIP), rebar, iron beams, etc.

Table 2 represents the cost comparison with past DWM lift station projects which compares dollars per gallon for each project. Kensington LS price is \$2.61 per gallon, which is in the middle range, compared to the others ranging from \$4.91 to \$1.33 per gallon. So, the proposed bid price from Ruby Collins is reasonable compared with other LS projects from the past.

DWM evaluation has resulted in Ruby Collins being deemed the lowest, most responsive and responsible bidder meeting the minimum requirements of the ITB. Therefore, it is the recommendation of the DWM that a contract for this project be awarded to Ruby Collins in the amount not to exceed two million, three hundred ten thousand, six hundred and sixty seven dollars (\$2,310,667.00).

Kerry Williams,
P.E., PMP

Digitally signed by Kerry Williams, P.E., PMP
DN: cn=Kerry Williams, P.E., PMP, o=DeKalb
Watershed, ou=ECMS,
email=kwilliams@dekalbcountyga.gov, c=US
Date: 2021.08.09 09:39:09 -0400

Supervisor/Designee

Date

Reginald Wells

Digitally signed by Reginald Wells
Date: 2021.08.09 11:26:29 -0400

Reginald D. Wells, Director

Date

Department of Watershed Management

Table 1: Cost Comparison 4 bidders VS the Engineer Opinion of Probable Construction Cost

Bid Tabulation - Kensington PS and Pipeline Project

Pay Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Ruby Collins		Sol Construction		Garney		GS Construction		
				Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	
Item 1												
(01210 1.04) UNIT PRICE BID ITEMS												
1	Abandon Existing Gravity Mains And Manholes	1	LS	\$ 54,765.00	\$ 54,765.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 26,000.00	\$ 16,000.00	\$ 16,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	
2	Package Pump Station	1	LS	\$ 201,859.00	\$ 201,859.00	\$ 143,000.00	\$ 143,000.00	\$ 190,000.00	\$ 190,000.00	\$ 2,800,000.00	\$ 2,800,000.00	
3	Wet Well and Appurtenances	1	LS	\$ 201,553.00	\$ 201,553.00	\$ 358,000.00	\$ 358,000.00	\$ 480,000.00	\$ 480,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	\$ 250,000.00	
4	Valve and Meter Vault	1	LS	\$ 117,641.00	\$ 117,641.00	\$ 90,000.00	\$ 90,000.00	\$ 135,000.00	\$ 135,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	
5	Gravity Sewer System	1	LS	\$ 308,506.00	\$ 308,506.00	\$ 316,000.00	\$ 316,000.00	\$ 540,000.00	\$ 540,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	
6	Pressurized Sewer System	1	LS	\$ 53,507.00	\$ 53,507.00	\$ 101,000.00	\$ 101,000.00	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	
7	Civil Site Work	1	LS	\$ 645,111.00	\$ 645,111.00	\$ 900,000.00	\$ 900,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 550,000.00	\$ 800,000.00	\$ 800,000.00	
8	Jib Crane and Hoist	1	LS	\$ 75,441.00	\$ 75,441.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	
9	Electrical Controls and Scada	1	LS	\$ 209,715.00	\$ 209,715.00	\$ 155,000.00	\$ 155,000.00	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 220,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	\$ 500,000.00	
10	Generator	1	LS	\$ 74,404.00	\$ 74,404.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	
11	Site Water Utility	1	LS	\$ 56,386.00	\$ 56,386.00	\$ 23,000.00	\$ 23,000.00	\$ 15,500.00	\$ 15,500.00	\$ 100,000.00	\$ 100,000.00	
12	Site Gas Utility	1	LS	\$ 69,086.00	\$ 69,086.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	
13	Erosion Control Complete	1	LS	\$ 59,598.00	\$ 59,598.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 40,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	
Item 2												
(01210 1.05) ADDITIONAL UNIT PRICE ITEMS AS DIRECTED BY OWNER												
A	Unsuitable Soil Replacement (Crusher Run)	50	CY	\$ 85.00	\$ 4,250.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 10,000.00	
B	Stabilization Matting	150	SY	\$ 1.50	\$ 225.00	\$ 5.00	\$ 750.00	\$ 2.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 7,500.00	
C	Seeding	150	SY	\$ 3.00	\$ 450.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 600.00	\$ 0.50	\$ 75.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 2,250.00	
D	Site Fence (Type C)	200	LF	\$ 7.50	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 800.00	
E	Check Dams	2	EA	\$ 85.00	\$ 170.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 1,000.00	
F	CCTV Inspection (8" And Smaller Diameter Pipe)	1500	LF	\$ 11.00	\$ 16,500.00	\$ 3.00	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 5,250.00	\$ 10.00	\$ 15,000.00	
Item 3				OWNER DIRECTED WORK ALLOWANCE								
				Allowance	\$ 160,000.00	Allowance	\$ 160,000.00	Allowance	\$ 160,000.00	Allowance	\$ 160,000.00	
TOTAL BASE BID (ITEM 1 + ITEM 2 + ITEM 3)				Ruby Collins	\$ 2,310,667.00	Sol Construction	\$ 2,430,150.00	Garney	\$ 2,486,925.00	GS Construction	\$ 6,121,550.00	

Engineer Opinion of Probable Construction Cost		
R2T 100% Opinion of Probable Construction Cost (7/17/2020)	\$	2,083,454.29
Month/Year	ENR Index	
Using ENR Construction Cost Index	Jul-20	11,439
(industry standard to compare project prices)	Jul-21	12,237
Cost Escalation Factor		1.070
Adjusted R2T OPCC		\$ 2,228,798.86

Ruby Collins	\$	2,310,667.00	Sol Construction	\$	2,430,150.00	Garney	\$	2,486,925.00	GS Construction	\$	6,121,550.00
Low Apparent Bidder to EOR OPPC			3.54%			Spread (lowest three bidders)			7.63%		
Excluding 4th bid (3x higher) - no significant unit price bid unbalances noted.											

Table 2; Cost Comparison the lowest bidder (Ruby Collin) VS the past DWM Lift Station Projects

Assuming Ruby gets this as low at \$2.3M, below is where that falls in terms of \$/gpd compared to the other CIP PS/LS that have been bid over the years:

DeKalb CIP PMS Bid Schedule								
Project	Type	# of Bids Rec'd	Rec Award to	Engineer Estimate Const Cost	Bid Award Amount	Primary Bid Metric Unit	Primary Bid Metric Qty	Unit Cost for Primary Bid Metric
Lithonia No. 1 PS	DB RFP	2	R&Y/AMEC/R&C Infratech	\$15,000,000	\$15,500,000	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	4,497,000	\$3.45
Columbia Dr PS	DB RFP	3	Sol/ESS	\$1,600,000	\$1,649,500	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	345,600	\$4.77
Honey Creek PS/FM	DB RFP	4	Garney/TetraTech	\$22,000,000	\$24,423,000	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	7,371,000	\$1.63
Johnson Creek PS	DB RFP	3	R&Y/AMEC/R&C Infratech	\$12,000,000	\$13,900,000	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	2,829,000	\$4.91
Hearn Road LS	DB RFP	3	R&Y/R&C Infratech	\$1,493,000	\$2,073,000	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	1,417,860	\$1.46
2018 CD 5 PS (Lewis Way/4thSt/Stone Mill1&2/Pennybrook)	DB RFP	3	Sol/Prime	\$4,584,765	\$5,705,060	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	3,209,760	\$1.74
Hammermill 1 LS Replacement	DBB	2	Sol Const	\$1,127,245	\$648,815	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	663,840	\$1.33
Kensington LS	ITB	7	Ruby-Collins	\$2,083,454	\$2,310,667	2045 PHF Flow Rate (gpd)	747,117	\$2.61

It's not as low as the other smaller LS projects we've seen in the 5 CD LS and Hammermill, but it's not as high as the bigger stations like Lithonia/Honey Creek/Johnson Creek either. Also, that \$2.3M has some linework in it as well FM/GS which the others don't so it can be expected to be higher.