

RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Axis Infrastructure	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Adequate
<p>Project Manager - managed some GDOT PDP projects (not really trail projects), 1 Bridge project with trail; PM has GDOT, very little trail;</p> <p>Key Team Lead - Bike/Ped Lead, not mentioned in narrative; had Bike/Ped lead was using on trail but didn't connect dots to PM;</p> <p>Prime Experience in Projects: last trail project was 2006, Prime lacked experience but subs were strong; lacked consistency in projects; was not cohesive in projects being detailed.</p>			
Resources Availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Project Manager workload - appeared to have 85% availability;</p> <p>Key Team Leaders - similar availability as PM</p> <p>Resources - Bike/Ped person to have the most experience, did not document well enough to show experience, QA/QC process left to want especially in narrative of response</p> <p>Project Schedule - N/A</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Pond & Company	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Project Manager - not PE, registered landscape architect but had experience; lot of experience with Trails and Greenway's, not all educational background but had the experience; listed as Tech lead on trail projects but was lead but not documented as GDOT PDP project; unclear as to what was DOT; Key Team Leaders - Roadway Lead, no DOT listed, PIC, did not list on previous project (ROCA), have the PM and Ped/Bike as landscape architects, leaning heavily on Road Lead, did not indicate experience (won't be signing plans)</p> <p>Prime Consultant experience - enviro member is all Prime experience. Team did not come across strong.</p>			
Resources Availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Project Manager Workload - approximately 50% availability; has availability not clear when is available;</p> <p>Key Team Members - Bike/Ped Lead had 80% availability -</p> <p>Resources - plenty of resources, fair amount of staff as back-up; listing key team members but seems everyone is working on, not sure who is working on project. did not mention QA/QC.</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Bridgefarmer & Associates, Inc.	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Poor
<p>Project Manager - did not show GDOT projects, TX was utilized</p> <p>Key Team Leaders - did not show GDOT other than environmental</p> <p>Prime Consultant - did not show GDOT projects</p>			
Resources availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Poor
<p>Project Manager Workload - showed about 75% availability</p> <p>Key Team Leads - Bike/Ped showed not as much availability (20%)</p> <p>Resources - does not have any GDOT resources,</p>			

RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Keck + Wood	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Project Manager - had managed other GDOT Trail Projects for cities; Key Team Leads - Bike/Ped had been involved in at least 5 different trails; Road lead has lots of GDOT, but Prime has lots of trail experience Prime Consultant - Prime has lots of trail experience; projects were varied 2 were DOT, projects listed were very fast documented; scopes/monies were widely varied</p>			
Resources availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Project Manager Workload - 66% available Key Team Leads - Bike/Ped and Road - little less than 50% Resources dedicated to delivering - GDOT experience; laid out very well, easy to interpolate for dedicated time</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Kimley-Horn	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Project Manager - experience on GDOT funded roadway projects; only 1 listed as multi-use trail; Mike Lobdell had previous GDOT work experience Key Team Leads - Bike/Ped lead has experience on four other trail projects; 3 GDOT related; similar GDOT trail projects all PEs Prime Consultant - good spread of projects to show experience of time and value; one was scoping project for this request; more consistency with response than other responders</p>			
Resources availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Project Manager - 15% availability Key Team Leads - Bike/Ped at 40% Resources - experience utilizing resources of GDOT, mentioned using Alpharetta as additional support if needed</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 1 SUMMARY COMMENTS FOR TOP SUBMITTALS	
Firm	Prime Engineering, Inc.	# of Evaluators	4
Experience and Qualifications		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Project Manager - similar project experience; GDOT/DOT experience, perhaps acting as Key Team for road design? Key Team Lead - Roadway did not have PE, PIP/Roadway, not much documented experience. PM may be carrying others, small team, minimal on project side. Qualified but small, less experience Prime Consultant - small team, minimal on project side. Qualified but small, less experience</p>			
Resources availability and Workload Capacity		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Project Manager - 45% availability; - Prime availability is there but very small, not sure on back-ups, if one was to lead would they be capable of continuing on Resources - if PM leaves, project may stop</p>			

RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 2 SUMMARY COMMENTS	
Firm	Keck + Wood		
Technical Approach		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Seemed to focus on getting through GDOT process - did mention going through COA and potential challenges; recommended additional public outreach, lacked top down construction and different materials than standard wood on boardwalks, liked looking to mitigate things to keep schedule</p>			
Past Performance		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>Members did not have previous experience. References received from City of Buford and Dallas - Buford Multi-Use Trail, Phase 1, Phase 2 - approximately \$600k, completed in 2021, on time, average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally completed, worked well with PM, rated average overall, would do business again</p> <p>City of Dallas, Battlefield Trail, Phase 1, Phase 2 - approximately \$9M, multi-use trail system, bridge and ROW design</p> <p>Phase 1 completed in 2019, Phase 2 anticipated completed of June 2024, average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally completed, worked well with PM, rated excellent overall, would do business again</p> <p>Based on results of references committee determined to split and assign good</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 2 SUMMARY COMMENTS	
Firm	Kimley-Horn		
Technical Approach		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>lot of experience of similar projects; talked about top-down construction; talked about alternatives to wood; also recognized challenges of key-road and COA - discussion of crime prevention through design was detailed and interesting; had very targeted outreach to area, liked alternatives that were proposed, proposal was very organized</p>			
Past Performance		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Committee previous experience - South Fork Creek Phase 4 - GDOT funded Trail Project - did excellent job. References received from Cumberland CID and Atlanta BeltLine</p> <p>Cumberland CID, Bob Callan Multiuse Trail Phase II (PI0010009) - approximately \$816k, completed in 2019, Project was delayed to funding issues but KHA work on time, easy to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally completed, worked well with PM, rated excellent overall, would do business again</p> <p>Atlanta BeltLine Southside Trail Design, approximately \$14.5M, design services completed in 2023, easy/average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally</p>			

RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 2 SUMMARY COMMENTS	
Firm	Pond & Company		
Technical Approach		Assigned Rating	Excellent
<p>Noted top-down construction as possibility, put emphasis on risks in general; key road crossing; bridge over creek bringing challenges and mitigation; scrutiny and PM lives w/in two-miles of site; careful about environmental issues with battle of Atlanta, preserve artifacts as needed/wanted; top-down; maintenance, liked how included examples and mitigated other projects similarly, definitely answered questions from RFQ; well thought out; assigning personnel based on project was unique to project</p>			
Past Performance		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>References received from Gwinnett County and Alpharetta Gwinnett County, Western Gwinnett Bikeway – PI# 0012883 - provided engineering consulting services for the design and prep of construction plans, pedestrian bridge, drainage, retaining walls, signing and marking, erosion control, other features: construction of approximately \$14.4M, completed 2021, average rating, deliverables were accurately and professionally completed, worked well with PM, rated average overall and would do business again Alpharetta - Big Creek Greenway Extension - approximately \$10M - completed 2021, on time, average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally</p>			
RFQ	23-500646	PHASE 2 SUMMARY COMMENTS	
Firm	Prime Engineering, Inc.		
Technical Approach		Assigned Rating	Good
<p>good experience on multi-use trails; did provide options, mentioned materials and techniques, generic overview of PDP process, the presentation was generic, especially public involvement. Only one to question current concept; alignment of key elements; value engineering - could be good or bad; not personalized</p>			
Past Performance		Assigned Rating	Adequate
<p>References received from Marietta and Coweta Marietta, Kennesaw Mountain – Chattahoochee River (KMCR) Trail – PI#0010705, approximately \$270k, completed in 2021 (construction), average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally completed, worked well with PM, rated average overall and would do business again *Did include that initially had issues with responsiveness but once management got involved were worked out. Issue with construction plans were sidewalk quantity was listed as SF in the plan but measure in SY. Lead to significant over-run in the estimated cost once discovered. Worked with us to find ways to reduce project costs and able to keep costs close to original. Coweta, Chattahoochee Hill Country Regional Greenway Trail: Coweta Pilot Project GDOT PI#000294 - approximately \$144k, completed in 2016, project was delayed but not vendor fault, average to keep on schedule, deliverables were accurately and professionally delivered, worked well with PM, rated average overall and would do business again</p>			