

# DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Monday, September 17, 2018- 7:00 P.M.

## Staff Report

### **Regular Agenda**

H. 1534 North Decatur Road (DH), Linda Dunlavy. Redesign the building exterior, add a brick veneer and replace the windows. 1235216

Built 1965. (18 053 02 028)

This property is in the Druid Hills National Register Historic District, but not in a designated character area.

7-18 1534 North Decatur Road (DH), Robert Scott. Redesign and replace the shell of the building. 1235080 **For comment only**

8-18 1534 North Decatur Road (DH), Robert Scott. Redesign and replace the shell of the building. 1235169 **For comment only**

This is a nonhistoric property. (*Druid Hills Design Manual*, Glossary, page ii: **Nonhistoric** — Nonhistoric properties within the district are those properties constructed after 1946. Nonhistoric properties are identified on the Historic District Map.)

Revised plans were received 9:12 a.m. on Friday 9-14. This report has been updated, but parts are just in note form.

NOTE: Page A1.1 appears to be a duplicate of A1.0 and the plan at the bottom of the pages is labeled as first floor plan, but is actually the second floor. The drawings are in accurate is most ways, but the errors are in documentation and should not affect the accuracy of the proposed plans.

The building does not need to be made to look historic, but should not detract from its setting any more than the existing building. The area of influence will contribute to the difficulty with appropriate design. The house to the left is a historic, two-story brick house (built 1929), converted for nonresidential use. The property across the street is an apartment complex (built 1960), diagonally opposite, across both the creek and the street, is the Panera Bread building, (built 1962, but heavily remodeled), and immediately across the creek is the small commercial building that houses Dave's Cosmic Subs (built 1962) and the CVS parking lot. The Emory Village Character Area ends at the creek, but the Druid Hills Character Area 1 begins at the left property line of this property.

The subject building is a two-story, rectangular block with a flat roof. The building is about 40' wide and about 97' long. The front façade is clad with glass, metal panels and concrete panels with a pebbled surface. The right side is clad with metal panels and windows, the rear with CMU and the left side CMU and what appear to be large metal panels.

The two-story section of the adjacent house is about house is about 35.5' wide, growing to 45.5 when the one-story wing is added. These figures include the overhangs.

### **Architectural design**

The proposed design adds false historical details to a noncontributing building, and in this case, false historical details that are not found elsewhere in the district. The redesign appears to be an amalgam of commercial design elements from late 19<sup>th</sup>/early 20<sup>th</sup> century with some nods toward earlier residential design. **This has been reduced in the 9-14 revised plans.**

The applicant may consider emulating either the mostly 1940s/1950s commercial buildings in the village or the 1920s residential in the vicinity. If commercial, Emory Village Design Standards would be the guide. The relevant standards are included in the list at the end of the report. Among other things, the guidelines require 2-story new buildings although there aren't any now. The arguments in favor of a commercial design are the difficulty in adapting the building to look like a house and the visual relationship of the building to Emory Village.

Alternatively, the building could be made to resemble a house. In that case chapter 7.0 would apply. A building of this size and massing does not easily lend itself to residential design

### **Concerns with the original plan**

The nearby commercial buildings are from the mid to later 20<sup>th</sup> century. (Two more elaborate buildings are on the corner of North Decatur and Oxford, but are too far away to serve as good models.) The architectural elements of the plan are quite different from those of the buildings in Emory Village. The remodeled building is ornate, using stylistic elements more associated with pre-WW I construction than the simple, utilitarian structures in Emory Village. For example, but not necessarily a complete list:

- ~~1. Flemish bond brick on the ground floor (using Flemish and running bond on the same façade appears to be an unusual treatment generally.);~~
- ~~2. Large brick pilasters at the corners;~~
- ~~3. 2/2 windows;~~
- ~~4. Arches over the windows on the sides;~~
- ~~5. Simulated cast iron pilasters;~~
6. Insufficient glass in the doors;
7. Insufficient glass on the ground floor front façade.

Other concerns may be adding brick on all four sides; the size and design of the parapet; wide stringcourse; stone panel sign and decorative precast panels; paired windows on the front; the use of double-hung windows on the front ground floor.

There are also problems with insufficient and contradictory material.

1. The site plan does not show the porch. **Provided 9-14**
2. A walkway will be necessary, but it is not shown on the site plan and no other information has been provided. **Provided 9-14**
3. The plan does not provide dimensions or materials of the elevator override. **Provided 9-14**

4. ~~The general note on page A1.3 says the existing roof and drainage will remain and be refurbished as necessary, but a note on drawing says a new roof slope will be recreated to direct the flow to scuppers on the left side of the building. These statements appear contradictory. On a practical note, if scuppers put the runoff on the west side of the building, this is uphill, which will keep the moisture next to the foundation. The roof drainage will be generally unchanged.~~ **Clarified 9-14**
5. The 75" stream buffer must be added to the survey/site plan. What appears to be a seawall will likely eliminate the buffer in the front yard. **Provided 9-14**
6. Details of the windows are required. **Provided 9-14**
7. Since the parapet will make the building 2.5' taller, a drawing may be needed showing the comparative heights of the building and the Jewish Center building. **Provided 9-14**
8. Will the brick be standard size?

### **Architectural drawings received 9-14**

- A1.3 says some sections of exterior wall will remain, but A1.0 makes it appear as if the walls will be removed. It is possible the walls exist behind the metal panels.
- 4 sides brick running bond
- All windows are to be primed wood with simulated divided lights.
- Brick sills and soldier course headers.
- Most of the ground floor windows are an unusual 6/6 design, with three lights set vertically on either side of a center vertical muntin. The upstairs windows are smaller 4/4.
- The windows nearest the front and nearest the rear are paired, with the rest set singly.
- Some windows on north are inset brick faux windows.
- Decorative precast panels on front parapet flanking a centered stone panel with text.
- Brick pilasters in all four corners. Raise parapet 2.5'.
- Slight corbeling at top of parapet.
- Brick inset panels in parapet on both sides.
- Large lamps flank the entry. The drawings do not provide much detail. Similar lamps are set on the rear.
- Elevator override is required at the top of the elevator. This projects 2'11" above the roof.
- On rear install stairs with a porch at the top. Standing seam metal roof over the porch at the top of the stairs.
- The concrete front porch will be centered in the façade. It will be 16' wide and will project 10' from the building. Low brick with concrete caps walls will wrap around both sides of the porch, with the walkway access in the middle. The concrete walkway will curve toward the driveway and will meet ADA standards. The driveway is lower than the front porch. The drawings show the area of the existing side porch and part of the side planting strip as being paved as an extension of the walkway. The walkway and part of the porch appear to be in the 75' stream buffer.
- Cantilevered metal canopy over front porch, but appears to be supported by cables from above. Pilasters flank the front double doors. Transom over doors. Four light windows over wood panels. Paired 6/6 windows flank the entry and three pairs of 4/4 windows are set on the second floor.

~~With one exception running bond is used on all the exposed brick on the buildings in Emory Village and on North Decatur Road between the village and Oakdale Road. 1442 North Decatur uses common bond (American bond). Several of the buildings in Emory Village have double doors, but these are all glass. None of the doors appear to be original. Most of the storefronts are wood and brick. There are low-relief pilasters between some of the stores and at the front west corner of the block of stores on the north side of the street. This is only on the front and does not wrap around. The pilasters are brick on a concrete or stone base. Almost all of the stores appear to have originally had full front windows. Some stores use common brick on the sides and rear while others use larger brick on these secondary walls.~~

The Emory Village buildings generally have low, plain parapets or lack parapets. CVS has a high parapet at the front but low elsewhere. The high section was probably added when the addition was made to the west side of the building. One element of an earlier design that might help the subject building relate to its immediate neighbor is the clay tile faux-roof on the building where Wa Ga Ya is located. Although not found on the newer buildings in the village, the use of something similar might ease the transition better than plain parapet. The adjacent house and several other houses in that block have clay tile roofs.

### **Recommendation**

This plan does not relate to the house next door, the only historic structure in the area of influence. In this particular circumstance, it might be appropriate to use nearby commercial buildings as models, but this plan does not do so.

The proposed changes are not in character with the area of influence and do not comply with the relevant guidelines in 7.0. These changes would have a substantial adverse effect on the building and the district and staff recommends denial.

### **Relevant Guidelines**

- 7.1 *Defining the Area of Influence* (p64) Guideline - In considering the appropriateness of a design for a new building or addition in a historic district, it is important to determine the area of influence. This area should be that which will be visually influenced by the building, i.e. the area in which visual relationships will occur between historic and new construction.
- 7.2 *Recognizing the Prevailing Character of Existing Development* (p65) Guideline - When looking at a series of historic buildings in the area of influence, patterns of similarities may emerge that help define the predominant physical and developmental characteristics of the area. These patterns must be identified and respected in the design of additions and new construction.
- 7.2.2 *Directional Emphasis* (p67) Guideline - A new building's directional emphasis should be consistent with dominant patterns of directional emphasis within the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.3 *Shape: Roof Pitch* (p68) Guideline - The roof pitch of a new building should be consistent with those of existing buildings within the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.
- 7.2.3 *Shape: Building Elements* (p68) Guideline - The principal elements and shapes used on the front facade of a new building should be compatible with those of existing buildings in the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.

H. 1534 North Decatur Road (DH), Robert Scott  
page five

- 7.2.3 *Shape: Porch Form* (p68) Guideline - The shape and size of a new porch should be consistent with those of existing historic buildings within the area of influence, if dominant patterns are present.
- 7.2.4 *Massing* (p69) Guideline - The massing of a new building should be consistent with dominant massing patterns of existing buildings in the area of influence, if such patterns are present.
- 7.2.7 *Scale/Height* (p72) Guideline - New construction in historic areas should be consistent with dominant patterns of scale within the area of influence, if such patterns are present. Additions to historic buildings should not appear to overwhelm the existing building.
- 7.2.8 *Individual Architectural Elements* (p73) Guideline - New construction and additions should be compatible and not conflict with the predominant site and architectural elements—and their design relationships—of existing properties in the area of influence.
- 7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - These guidelines do not recommend adding false historical details to a noncontributing building in an effort to make it more compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Every effort should be made, however, to ensure that additions and alterations to the property do not detract further from the character of the historic environment, keeping in mind the design concepts discussed in Section 7.2.
- 7.3.2 *New Construction and Subdivision Development* (p75) Guideline - To be compatible with its environment, new construction should follow established design patterns of its historic neighbors, including building orientation, setback, height, scale, and massing.
- 7.3.2 *New Construction and Subdivision Development* (p75) Guideline - New construction should respect the historic character that makes the area distinctive, but it should not be a mere imitation of historic design.
- 8.3 *Protection of the Historic Watershed Design and Design Concept* (p79) - Guideline - All construction within the Druid Hills Local Historic District should follow a 75' setback requirement from the top of bank of creek corridors and drainage ways, as delineated on the official "Historic District Map."
- 9.7 *Residential Landscape Design* (p91) Recommendation - For residential yards, created without the assistance of landscape designers, historic landscape plans for other residential lots within the district should be used for guidance. These plans can be interpreted to create a new landscape plan that is based on historic traditions. Care should be taken to select designs for yards of similar size containing houses of similar style and scale.
- 11.0 *Nonhistoric Properties* (p93) Guideline - In reviewing an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a material change to a nonhistoric building, the Preservation Commission should evaluate the change for its potential impacts to any historic development (architecture and natural and cultural landscapes) in the area of influence of the nonhistoric property. Guidelines presented in *Section 7.0: Additions and new Construction* are relevant to such evaluations.
- 16.3.A.5 *Entrances*. All first story uses adjacent to a sidewalk shall have a primary pedestrian entrance, which faces, is visible from, and is directly accessible from said sidewalk. Entrance doors shall remain unlocked and operable during normal business hours. All first story businesses with more than sixty (60) feet of frontage along sidewalks shall provide one (1) pedestrian entrance for every sixty (60) linear feet of frontage or fraction thereof.
- 16.3.A.6 *Storefront canopies* at least five feet in depth extending over the sidewalk are recommended at all retail frontage in the Village for relief from inclement weather and for shade. These should be roofed with glass, metal, or fabric wholly supported by brackets or cables attached to the building façade. Columns to support canopies are not permitted in the public right of way (hereafter called "R.O.W."). Awnings and canopies shall not include signage on them, except when such signage is located within an apron that is less than twelve inches in height and is subject to all other applicable sign requirements of this document.

- 16.3.A.7 *Building Finish Materials.* Each street-facing building facade shall have an exterior finish skin of one or a combination of no more than three of the following primary materials: exterior brick, cementitious stucco, rustic or cut stone, architectural cast concrete, decorative terra cotta, and glass panels. Decorative embellishments shall be permanent in nature and shall be of the following materials: copper, brass, bronze, cast concrete, formed exterior plaster, solid plastic, porcelain tile, terra cotta, formed metals, glass, wood, and artificial materials having the appearance of wood, and/or stone. Window and storefront systems shall be painted wood or painted metal, and all glazing shall be clear glass; no tinted glass will be accepted. Materials that match those used historically in the Village, such as black reflective glass tile, red terra cotta roof tile, stone, stucco and brick are recommended. Non-street-facing building facades may be of any of the materials authorized for street-facing facades, plus wood siding. Architectural concrete masonry units (CMU), MDF plywood and Exterior Insulation Finish Systems (EIFS) are not permitted as building finishes. Other building materials may be permitted in the Village if included as part of a building system or assembly designed to improve building energy and/or environmental performance or to limit adverse impacts of the building on the environment, or to limit airborne pollutants from the building. Primary building façade materials shall be combined only horizontally, with the heavier appearing one(s) below the lighter appearing (ones). This shall not apply to embellishments, storefronts systems, or windows frames.
- 16.3.A.8 *First Story Fenestrations.* All street-fronting first stories shall have windows that meet the following requirements along the portion of the building fronting a public street or public sidewalk. They shall be of clear, unpainted or similarly treated glass to allow views of store interior or display windows. Windows shall be located along a minimum of seventy five (75) percent of street frontage. They shall start a maximum of three feet above the sidewalks and shall have a minimum height of ten feet above the sidewalks. The maximum façade length without windows shall be ten feet. Glass doors may count towards fenestration requirements.
- 16.3.A.9 *Upper story fenestrations.* - All building stories above the first story shall have windows and doors that equal a minimum of thirty (30) percent of the total facade area, with each story being calculated independently. Additionally, all street-facing upper story windows shall be taller than they are wide and shall be predomintly arranged in a grid, subject to individual window variation.
- 16.3.A.10 *Building Signage.* Allowable signs shall include those documented to have existed in Emory Village prior to 1980 may be considered provided that they meet other criteria herein and are approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. Furthermore, the number of signs and metrics thereof shall be as established for non-residential zoning districts in Chapter 21, Section 21-20 of the Code of Ordinances of DeKalb County, subject to the modifications contained herein.
- Signage shall be designed to complement the architectural features of the buildings it is on, and such signage shall be consistent with respect to size, scale, material, and design of such buildings. Signs may be lit by duck/gooseneck lamps, and back/silhouette lighting. Individual sign lettering shall be a maximum of 15 inches in height. Appropriate locations for signage within traditional storefronts includes at lintels which separate storefronts from the upper floors, the space above the transoms in the storefronts, and the windows.
- 16.3.A.11 *Awnings.* Awnings shall be of canvas and similar fabrics, fixed metal, or similar materials. Internally lit awnings and canopies that emit light through the awning or canopy material are prohibited.
- 16.3.A.12 *Lighting.* Building facades facing a public R.O.W. shall be illuminated for safety and aesthetics. Lighting shall be designed to avoid producing glare in the public R.O.W. Light spillage onto adjacent residential properties shall be minimized by cutoff luminaires.
- 16.3.A.15 *Rooftop Mechanical features* shall be set at least ten (10) feet from the edges of roofs and screened vertically from view through use of parapet walls or similar features. Additionally, all such features greater than five (5) feet in height shall be set a least twenty (20) feet behind front building façades.

16.3.B.3 *Landscaping*. All areas in the Village not developed with buildings or prepared surfaces for parking, circulation, utilities or the like, shall be landscaped and permanently maintained with ornamental plantings. In surface parking lots, shade trees shall be planted at a minimum rate of one tree per ten cars. These shall be arranged so that at least 50% of the paved area is shaded at midday in midsummer in order to reduce the heat island effect. Paved areas of the site shall be limited in size to the area required to accommodate the intended use.