



DeKalb County Government

Manuel J. Maloof Center
1300 Commerce Drive
Decatur, Georgia 30030

Agenda Item

File ID: 2018-3013

Substitute

2/26/2019

Purchasing Type: Low Bidders (LB)

Public Hearing: YES NO

Department: Purchasing & Contracting

AGENDA ITEM:

Commission District(s): All

LB - ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew): for use by Departments of Watershed Management (DWM), Facilities Management (FM), Recreation, Parks, and Cultural Affairs (RPCA), Public Works - Beautification (PWB) and Public Works - Roads & Drainage (R&D). Consists of providing tree cutting and removal services countywide on an as needed basis. Recommend a multi-award to the responsive and responsible bidders: Arborserv Tree Care, Casey Tree Experts and K2R Legacy Group. Total Amount Not To Exceed: \$3,435,000.00.

Information Contact: Talisa Clark, CPPO

Phone Number: (404) 687-2797

PURPOSE:

This is an on-call service contract utilized by various County departments. A multi-award is most advantageous to the County to ensure that overall cost savings are achieved, while providing timely and efficient delivery of services throughout the County. County departments' needs are similar; however, the usage is specific to their operations. Each user department shall administer necessary services to ensure effective contract management, which includes the utilization and availability of the lowest cost vendors, County inspection of work completed and payment of invoices. Each work order will be assigned based on the lowest quote received from the three vendors and the vendor's availability to complete the work. Line item nos.: 43-50, 53 and 54 are not recommended for award due to the price variance received. Five (5) bids were received.

RECOMMENDATION:

Recommend a multi-award to the responsive and responsible bidders:

Arborserv Tree Care, 2290 S. Stone Mountain Lithonia Road, Lithonia, GA 30058

Note: LSBE-DeKalb Firm: 100%

Estimated Amount: \$1,145,000.00

Casey Tree Experts, 4135 Arcadia Industrial Circle, Lilburn, GA 30047

Estimated Amount: \$1,145,000.00

K2R Legacy Group, 1614 Rice Road, Lithonia, GA 30058

Notes: 1. LSBE-DeKalb Firm

2. LSBE Participation: 20%

Estimated Amount: \$1,145,000.00



DeKalb County Government

Manuel J. Maloof Center
1300 Commerce Drive
Decatur, Georgia 30030

Total Amount Not To Exceed \$3,435,000.00

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Contract Effective Date: | Date of Award |
| 2. Contract Expiration Date: | 1 year term with 2 options to renew |
| 3. Amount Spent on Previous Contracts: | \$4,472,771.01 |
| 4. Funding: | \$ 660,000.00 - Special Tax District (RPCA)
\$1,050,000.00 - Special Tax District (R&D)
\$ 650,000.00 - General - Operating (DWM)
\$ 75,000.00 - General Operating (FM)
\$1,000,000.00 - Special Tax District - Unincorporated (PWB) |
| 5. Additional Bidders: | |

Georgia Power
1036 Rowan Circle
Watkinsville, GA 30677
(Non-Responsive)

C & C Disaster Tree Service
3413 Highway 81-E
McDonough, GA 30252
(Non-Responsive)

AGENDA NOTES

Solicitation Name and Number	18-100975- Tree Cutting and Removal Service (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)
Procurement Agent	Judi Moore
Date Solicitation bid prices expires. (Indicate if vendor has agreed to extend bid date/prices. Include new date.)	December 17, 2018 Extended until March 17, 2019
Solicitation Name, Number and Contract Number of Expiring Contract (If no previous contract, please indicate N/A)	ITB 3003423- Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew) CPA# 975615 (Arborserv, Inc.) CPA# 975721 (Casey Tree Experts, Inc.)
Expiring Contract Number, Contractor Name and Award Amount (Include increases and Total Award Amount)	<p>\$5,679,706.00</p> <p>CPA No. 975615 (Arborserv, Inc.) \$950,000.00 - Initial Term \$312,500.00 - 1st Renewal \$742,353.00 - 2nd Renewal \$1,335,000.00 - C.O. 1 Total- \$3,339,853.00</p> <p>CPA No. 975721 (Casey Tree Experts, Inc.) \$950,000.00 - Initial Term \$312,500.00 - 1st Renewal \$492,353.00 - 2nd Renewal \$585,000.00 - C.O. 1 Total- \$2,339,853.00</p>
Previous Amount Spent on Expiring/Expired Contract (If multiple award, List Amount Spent per Contract and include Total Amount Spent)	<p>\$4,472,771.01</p> <p>CPA No. 975615 (Arborserv, Inc.) \$366,900.00 - Initial Term \$490,406.95 - 1st Renewal \$880,806.50 - 2nd Renewal \$1,208,444.50 - C.O. 1 Total- \$2,946,557.95</p> <p>CPA No. 975721 (Casey Tree Experts, Inc.) \$349,792.06 - Initial Term \$124,612.00 - 1st Renewal \$361,838.00 - 2nd Renewal \$689,971.00 - C.O. 1 Total- \$1,526,213.06</p>

<p>Prime Contractor Information and LSBE-Subcontractor (Prime: Company Name, Owner Name and Title, Number years in business and Number of Years doing business with DeKalb County) (LSBE: LSBE Type (DeKalb or MSA, Participation Percentage, Company Name, Owner Name and Title, Address, Type of Work Provided, Number of years in business and Previous Business/Contracts and Amounts in DeKalb County)</p>	<p><u>Arborserv, Inc. – Prime – LSBE-DeKalb</u> CEO: Darryl Dorton Years in Business: 8 Years doing business with DeKalb: 3</p> <p><u>Casey Tree Experts - Prime</u> CEO: Joann Casey Years in business: 39 Years doing business with DeKalb: 14 Demonstrated GFE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Attended the mandatory LSBE meeting · Price Schedule was submitted in a separate sealed enveloped · Casey Tree Experts provided the following attached documents: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Letter sent to potential LSBE subcontractors ○ Contact Log for LSBEs: The following vendors were contacted to verify that Casey Tree Experts attempted to obtain LSBE participation with the following results. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Mattis Lawn Care. - C 770-595-4870 – Left a message with my concern to verify receipt of form ▪ Excellent Lawn Service – 770-678-5727 - Left a message with my concern to verify receipt of form ▪ KL S - 817-6682 – Calvin Green does not remember receiving this form. ▪ Heritage Circle Realty – 404-216-4714 - Left a message with my concern to verify receipt <p><u>K2R Legacy Group LLC - Prime - LSBE-DeKalb</u> CEO: Ricky Miller, Sr. Years in business: 9 Years doing business with DeKalb: 2</p> <p><u>Lineage Partners, LLC, LSBE-DeKalb - 20%</u> P.O. Box 794, Lithonia, GA 30058 CEO: Ricky Miller, Sr. Years in business: 8 Years doing business with DeKalb: 0 Services to be Provided: Tree Cutting/Debris Removal</p>
<p>Attachments</p>	<p>Departments' Recommendation Bid Tabulation Response to Auditor's Assessment of ITB Tree Cutting Evaluation Report</p>



DeKalb County
GEORGIA

ITB No. ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Recreation, Parks and Cultural Affairs

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

Bidder 1: Casey Tree/\$220,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 2: Arborserv/\$220,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 3: K2R Legacy/\$220,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 4: _____
Name/Amount

Project Amount This Term: \$660,000

Line Items 43-50, 53 and 54 are will not be awarded under this contract.

Funding:

General Enterprise 3 Digit Fund Code: Special Tax District
CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): _____

Justification:

Recommend multi-award award to the three (3) responsive and responsible bidders. All vendors will be asked to provide a quote for each project and award will be made to the lowest cost, available vendor.

Pavel S. 2/19/2019
Name, Title, Date
Division Manager

B. M. J. ... 2/19/19
Department Director Date

Horner, Cathryn G.

From: Singer, Paige K.
Sent: Tuesday, February 19, 2019 9:15 AM
To: Clark, Talisa R
Cc: Horner, Cathryn G.; Robinson, Delois
Subject: FW: Out of office

Paige K. Singer
Division Manager, Park Services
Recreation, Parks and Cultural Affairs
3681 Chestnut Street
Scottdale, GA 30079
(404)687-3733
pbsinger@dekalbcountyga.gov/parks

-----Original Message-----

From: Ellis, Chuck
Sent: Tuesday, February 19, 2019 8:59 AM
To: Billups, Marvin F. <MFBillup@dekalbcountyga.gov>
Cc: Singer, Paige K. <pbsinger@dekalbcountyga.gov>; Ramsey, Terrence K. <tkramsey@dekalbcountyga.gov>; Flaherty, David L. <dflaherty@dekalbcountyga.gov>; Wheeler, Mellonise A <mawheele@dekalbcountyga.gov>; Manuel, David T. <dtmanuel@dekalbcountyga.gov>
Subject: Out of office

Good Morning,

This email authorizes Marvin Billups to act as Director in my absence. I will return Monday February 25, 2019.

Please contact me with any questions or concerns.

Thanks,
Chuck Ellis
Director

Sent from my iPhone



ITB No. ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Department of Watershed Management

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

Bidder 1: Casey Tree/\$216,666.66
Name/Amount

Bidder 2: Arborserv/\$216,666.67
Name/Amount

Bidder 3: K2R Legacy/\$216,666.67
Name/Amount

Bidder 4: _____
Name/Amount

Project Amount This Term: \$650,000.00

Funding:

General Enterprise 3 Digit Fund Code: 511

CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): _____

Justification:

Recommend multi-award award to the three (3) responsive and responsible bidders. All vendors will be asked to provide a quote for each project and award will be made to the lowest cost, available vendor. The bidders are recommended due to the potential amount of service that could be requested simultaneously from the various departments utilizing the contract.

Marketa H. Killingbeck cm=Marketa H. Killingbeck L=DeKalb County Government, ou=Department of Watershed Management, email=mkillingbeck@dekalbcountyga.gov, c=US 2019.02.19.09:15:02-0500

Reginald Wells

cm=Reginald Wells, o=DeKalb County Government, ou=Department of Watershed Management, email=rwells@dekalbcountyga.gov, c=US 2019.02.19.09:15:02-0500

Marketa H. Killingbeck, Project Coordinator

Reginald Wells, DWM Director

2/19/2019

2/19/2019

Date

Date

ITB No. ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Facilities Management

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

<p>Bidder 1: <u>Casey Tree/\$25,000.00</u> Name/Amount</p> <p>Bidder 3: <u>K2R Legacy/\$25,000.00</u> Name/Amount</p>	<p>Bidder 2: <u>Arborserv/\$25,000.00</u> Name/Amount</p> <p>Bidder 4: _____ Name/Amount</p>
---	--

Project Amount This Term: _____

Funding:
 General Enterprise **3 Digit Fund Code: Operating**
 CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): _____

Justification:

Recommend multi-award award to the three (3) responsive and responsible bidders. All vendors will be asked to provide a quote for each project and award will be made to the lowest cost, available vendor.

Name, Title, Date


 Department Director 2/19/19

 Date

ITB No. ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Roads & Drainage

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

Bidder 1: Casey Tree/\$350,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 2: Arborserv/\$350,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 3: K2R Legacy/\$350,000.00
Name/Amount

Bidder 4: _____
Name/Amount

Project Amount This Term: _____

Funding:

General Enterprise 3 Digit Fund Code: Special Tax District
CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): _____

Justification:

Recommend multi-award award to the three (3) responsive and responsible bidders. All vendors will be asked to provide a quote for each project and award will be made to the lowest cost, available vendor.

Name, Title, Date



Department Director

2/19/19

Date



ITB No. ITB No. 18-100975 Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with 2 Options to Renew)

User Department's Recommendation

User Department Name: Beautification

Recommended Bidder(s) meets our approval.

Bidder 1: Casey Tree/\$333,333.33
Name/Amount

Bidder 2: Arborserv/\$333,333.34
Name/Amount

Bidder 3: K2R Legacy/\$333,333.33
Name/Amount

Bidder 4: _____
Name/Amount

Project Amount This Term: _____

Funding:

General Enterprise
Unincorporated

3 Digit Fund Code: Special Tax District -

CIP Line Item No. (if applicable): _____

Justification:

Recommend multi-award award to the three (3) responsive and responsible bidders. All vendors will be asked to provide a quote for each project and award will be made to the lowest cost, available vendor. The tree services will be used as part of the 2019 Spring Clean Sweep.

R. W. LEMKE, PW DIR. 2-19-19
Name, Title, Date

[Signature] 2/19/19
Department Director Date

ITB No. 18-100975

ITB Name: TREE CUTTING AND REMOVAL SERVICES

DEPARTMENT OF PURCHASING AND CONTRACTING
REVISED BID TABULATION

Bid Opening: September 17, 2018 @ 3:00 p.m.
Price Schedule Opening: September 20, 2018 @ 10:00 a.m.
Agent: Judi Moore

ITEM	Company	ARBORSERV TREE CARE		CASEY TREE EXPERTS		K2R LEGACY GROUP	
		Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price
TREE REMOVAL (Refers to Specifications Section 3.0)							
1	Tree Removal – 4” to 12” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$160.00	Per Tree	\$300.00	Per Tree	\$120.00
2	Tree Removal – 13” to 24” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$400.00	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$450.00
3	Tree Removal - 25” to 36” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$900.00	Per Tree	\$1,400.00	Per Tree	\$1,100.00
4	Tree Removal – 37” to 48” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,300.00	Per Tree	\$1,900.00	Per Tree	\$1,600.00
5	Tree Removal – 49” to 60” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,500.00	Per Tree	\$2,100.00	Per Tree	\$2,150.00
6	Tree Removal – 61” or Greater (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,650.00	Per Tree	\$2,100.00	Per Tree	\$2,300.00
7	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding– 4” to 12” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$185.00	Per Tree	\$375.00	Per Tree	\$200.00
8	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding – 13” to 24” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$450.00	Per Tree	\$750.00	Per Tree	\$650.00
9	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding - 25” to 36” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$975.00	Per Tree	\$1,650.00	Per Tree	\$1,250.00
10	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding – 37” to 48” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,420.00	Per Tree	\$2,200.00	Per Tree	\$1,850.00
11	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding – 49” to 60” (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,650.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00
12	Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding – 61” or Greater (Diameter at 54”)	Per Tree	\$1,800.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00	Per Tree	\$3,050.00

Company		ARBORSERV TREE CARE		CASEY TREE EXPERTS		K2R LEGACY GROUP	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price
13	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 4" to 12" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$190.00	Per Tree	\$375.00	Per Tree	\$180.00
14	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 13" to 24" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$ 500.00	Per Tree	\$750.00	Per Tree	\$585.00
15	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 25" to 36" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$925.00	Per Tree	\$1,650.00	Per Tree	\$1,125.00
16	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 37" to 48" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,400.00	Per Tree	\$2,200.00	Per Tree	\$1,665.00
17	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 49" to 60" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,650.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00	Per Tree	\$2,200.00
18	Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 61" or Greater (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,850.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00	Per Tree	\$2,750.00
EMERGENCY TREE REMOVAL - Four (4) Hour Response Time Refers to Specifications, Section 4.0							
19	Emergency Tree Removal - 4" to 12" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$200.00	Per Tree	\$500.00	Per Tree	\$50.00
20	Emergency Tree Removal - 13" to 24" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$800.00	Per Tree	\$156.00
21	Emergency Tree Removal - 25" to 36" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,100.00	Per Tree	\$1,600.00	Per Tree	\$300.00
22	Emergency Tree Removal - 37" to 48" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,500.00	Per Tree	\$2,100.00	Per Tree	\$450.00
23	Emergency Tree Removal - 49" to 60" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$2,000.00	Per Tree	\$2,400.00	Per Tree	\$585.00
24	Emergency Tree Removal 61" or Greater (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$2,300.00	Per Tree	\$2,400.00	Per Tree	\$850.00
25	Emergency Tree Removal w/Slump Grinding - 4" to 12" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$225.00	Per Tree	\$575.00	Per Tree	\$60.00

Company		ARBORSERV TREE CARE		CASEY TREE EXPERTS		K2R LEGACY GROUP	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price
26	Emergency Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding - 13" to 24" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$650.00	Per Tree	\$950.00	Per Tree	\$250.00
27	Emergency Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding - 25" to 36" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,075.00	Per Tree	\$1,850.00	Per Tree	\$500.00
28	Emergency Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding - 37" to 48" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,470.00	Per Tree	\$2,200.00	Per Tree	\$600.00
29	Emergency Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding 49" to 60" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$2,150.00	Per Tree	\$2,450.00	Per Tree	\$2,180.00
30	Emergency Tree Removal w/Stump Grinding 61" or Greater (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$2,500.00	Per Tree	\$2,400.00	Per Tree	\$1,800.00
31	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 4" to 12" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$250.00	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$1,800.00
32	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 13" to 24" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$700.00	Per Tree	\$950.00	Per Tree	\$2,000.00
33	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 25" to 36" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,125.00	Per Tree	\$1,850.00	Per Tree	\$2,380.00
34	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal - 37" to 48" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,500.00	Per Tree	\$2,200.00	Per Tree	\$2,695.00
35	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal 49" to 60" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$1,800.00	Per Tree	\$2,400.00	Per Tree	\$3,250.00
36	Emergency Tree Removal w/Root Ball Removal 61" or Greater (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$2,000.00	Per Tree	\$2,400.00	Per Tree	\$3,890.00
TREE CUTTING REFERS TO SPECIFICATION, Sections 5.0							
37	Tree Cutting - 4" to 12" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$100.00	Per Tree	\$200.00	Per Tree	\$2,690.00
38	Tree Cutting - 13" to 24" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$150.00	Per Tree	\$300.00	Per Tree	\$2,899.00

Company		ARBORSERV TREE CARE		CASEY TREE EXPERTS		K2R LEGACY GROUP	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price
39	Tree Cutting – 25" to 36" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$350.00	Per Tree	\$400.00	Per Tree	\$3,250.00
40	Tree Cutting – 37" to 48" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$500.00	Per Tree	\$3,580.00
41	Tree Cutting – 49" to 60" (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$575.00	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$3,899.00
42	Tree Cutting – 61" or Greater (Diameter at 54")	Per Tree	\$700.00	Per Tree	\$600.00	Per Tree	\$4,385.00
STUMP GRINDING							
Refers to specifications, Section 6.0							
43	Refers to specifications, Section 6.0	Per Inch.	\$20.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$20.00
44	Stump Grinding – 13" to 24" (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$60.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$65.00
45	Stump Grinding – 25" to 36" (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$120.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$125.00
46	Stump Grinding – 27" to 48" (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$175.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$185.00
47	Stump Grinding – 49" to 60" (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$225.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$245.00
48	Stump Grinding – 61" or Greater (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$300.00	Per Inch.	\$7.00	Per Inch.	\$305.00
OTHER SERVICES							
Refers to specifications, Section 7.0, 8.0 and 9.0							
49	Bush Hogging	Per Acre	\$0.25	Per Acre	\$1,700.00	Per Acre	\$425.00
50	Growth Retardant Spraying	Per Acre	\$0.15	Per Acre	\$1,100.00	Per Acre	\$425.00
51	Tree Pruning, Trimming and Crowning	Per Crew	\$180.00	Per Crew	\$150.00	Per Crew	\$150.00
52	Tree Sapling Removal – 3" or Below	Per Tree	\$10.00	Per Tree	\$15.00	Per Tree	\$10.00
53	Brush & Vegetation Clearing	Per Acre	\$0.12	Per Acre	\$2,650.00	Per Acre	\$425.00
54	Root Ball removal and disposal (75 caliper inch and below)	Per Inch.	\$200.00	Per Inch.	\$10.00	Per Inch.	\$3.00
55	Waste Removal	Per Hour	\$200.00	Per Hour	\$75.00	Per Hour	\$100.00

Company		ARBORSERV TREE CARE		CASEY TREE EXPERTS		K2R LEGACY GROUP	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price	Unit of Measure	Total Price
56	Boom Services	Per Hour	\$150.00	Per Hour	\$100.00	Per Hour	\$250.00
57	Saw Man	Per Hour	\$60.00	Per Hour	\$75.00	Per Hour	\$150.00
Company							
Number of Bids Received:		5		LSBE-DeKalb Firm		GFE	
LSBE Participation Benchmark/GFE		Yes		Yes		Yes	
Attendance at the Mandatory LSBE Meeting (Yes/No)		Yes		Yes		Yes	
Separate Sealed Price Schedule (Yes/No)		Yes		Yes		Yes	
NOTES - DETAIL JUSTIFICATION							
<p>Recommend a multi-award to the responsive and responsible bidders:</p> <p>Arborserv Tree Care, 2290 S. Stone Mountain Lithonia Road, Lithonia GA 30058 Casey Tree Experts, 4135 Arcadia Industrial Circle, Lilburn, GA 30047 K2R Legacy Group, 1614 Rice Road, Lithonia, GA 30058</p> <p>* Georgia Power was deemed non-responsive for failing to submit the price schedule in a separate sealed envelope. C & C Disaster Tree Service was deemed nonresponsive for failing to have a minimum of five (5) years experience and to also furnish references and proof of competency from past jobs within the last ten years.</p> <p>Line items nos.: 43-50, 53 and 54 will not be awarded due to the price variance received.</p>							

Witness Signature: *Angel Fajars*
Agent Signature: *Jack Moore*

P&C worked collaboratively with the user departments to develop this solicitation and it advertised in July 2018.

1. The current contract solicited in FY2015 did not contain estimated quantities because typically an on-call services contract does not contain estimated quantities. Estimated quantities are standard for commodities (bulk) type procurements not for services that will be utilized on an as needed basis and usage is unknown. There is no way to calculate a volume of trees that will die or fall within a year to quantify an estimated amount for the ITB. This on-call services contract is utilized by various County departments and although their service needs are similar; their usage is specific in nature to their operations, so it was determined that this would be an all award to multiple vendors to meet or exceed the County's need. A line item bid would not be appropriate for an on-call tree contract because it is unusual for a department to remove a single tree at a time. For example, RPCA, typically, will have several trees (different sizes, etc.) in one park location that need to be removed. It would not be feasible to have one vendor remove a 12" tree and another vendor remove a 24" tree and another a 48" tree. Better pricing is obtained for one contractor to remove all trees at the same time (one work order request).
2. The user departments have various needs and volume usage; therefore, the awarded amounts are based on their individual need assessment and historical usage data. Work orders will be assigned to the lowest cost quote received from the three awarded vendors and their availability and schedule especially during storm events. We must have a way to be able to handle all tree requests when notified and if the lowest vendor is unavailable then we can utilize the next lowest quoted vendor. We can't wait for the lower priced contractor to become available when it comes to the removal of dangerous or emergency trees. That's not logical or practical and would cause a threat to public safety and welfare.
3. A mandatory pre-bid meeting was held and the solicitation requirements/price schedule was explained and questions answered. Seven (7) questions were officially received from the vendor market and two (2) questions were in regard to per inch for stump removal and root balls larger than 75 inches (Addendum #3). The County's answer regarding per inch for stump removal was to provide pricing as stated in the price schedule and the answer regarding root ball larger than 75 inches was this assumption needs to be included in their price schedule pricing. After receipt of bid submissions, P&C addressed and researched these potential errors/price differences for line items 43 thru 53. The vendors were contacted to verify the prices submitted and confirmed that the prices were per stump and not inches or acres as stated in the solicitation. It has been determined that these line items will not be awarded due to the price variances and has been reflected in the revised bid tabulation.

4. **The user departments have various needs and volume usage; therefore, the awarded amounts are based on their individual need assessment and historical usage data. The user departments will submit a revised award recommendation to divide their funding amount equally amongst the three awarded vendors.**
5. **The responsive and responsible bidders provided the required licenses and the numbers were verified by P&C. The user departments will manage the contracts and ensure that these licenses are maintained during the term of the contract.**
6. **K2R Legacy did provide the documentation of an Arborist license for Doni Jones with Don's Tree Services who agrees to work with the contracted vendor to provide these services. The license was verified and is valid through June 30, 2020.**

ITB18-100975 for Tree Cutting and Removal Services (Annual Contract with Options to Renew)

Evaluation Report

1. Bid Opening occurred on 9/17/18 and five bids were received.
2. Responsive Evaluation
 - a. Georgia Power was deemed non-responsive for failure to submit the price schedule in a separate sealed envelope.
 - b. C & C Disaster Tree Service was deemed non-responsive for failure to meet the requirement for a minimum of 5 years' experience.
 - c. Casey Tree Experts did not meet the LSBE participation benchmark but provided GFE which was approved by the CPO and remained responsive.
 - d. K2R Legacy Group and Arborserv were responsive.
3. The Price Schedule for the three (3) responsive bidders were opened on 9/20/18.
4. The Bid Tabulation was prepared and posted to the County website on 10/4/18.
5. The agenda item package was initiated, and the solicitation was reviewed in depth.
 - a. Corrections were made to calculations and typographical errors on Bid Tabulation (attached to the substitute agenda item).
6. Costs were examined as some were out of a competitive range (unbalanced bid). These line items will not be considered for an award and has been removed from the substitute agenda item.
7. The greatest variations of pricing occurred for stump grinding and other services, specifically items by vendor:
 - a. Arborserv - 44 – 50, 53 and 54. Pricing appears consistent with historical pricing, but historical pricing had a different unit of measure.
 - b. K2R – 44 – 48. No historical background but pricing appears to be per stump rather than the requested per inch.
8. On 1/3/19, bidders were asked to confirm that all submitted prices would be honored and all confirmed they would.
9. The issue regarding unbalanced bids was not resolved through the price confirmation. Discussions ensued, and P&C proceeded with obtaining clarification regarding the unit of measure that Arborserv and K2R used for the bids provided on the items in question. (See 7 above.) The goal was to obtain additional information to clarify how the bids were calculated without allowing bidders to submit corrected (different) pricing. Bidders were specifically told that this was not a request for submittal of new pricing. Clarifications were requested from both bidders on 1/8/19.
10. Arborserv's response provided the information as requested. The original bid price for stump grinding and root ball removal was confirmed as being accurately stated per inch. Even though Arborserv confirmed the price for stump grinding was per inch, this is inconsistent with their pricing provided on the previous contract which was \$4.50. The same conclusion is drawn regarding root ball removal. The last contract for root ball

removal with Arborserv was priced at \$100 per root ball and their current bid price is \$200.00 per inch. The response to the clarification of Items 49 and 50 supports that these items were incorrectly bid. The unit of measure for Items 49, 50 and 53 on the last contract was per linear foot and Arborserv indicated that the unit of measure for their bid on these items was per linear foot, not per acre as requested. There are 835 linear feet per acre and when converted, makes Arborserv the lowest bidder on the items. Note that Item 53, Bush & Vegetation Clearing, was not included in error but it is concluded that the same situation exists with the per acre unit of measure requested vs per linear foot bid. This item was omitted from the clarification process but appears to be like Items 49 and 50. The below conversions are from linear feet to per acre using the submitted bid price.

Item No.	Description	UOM on ITB	Response to Request for Clarification UOM Used on Bid	Bid Price	Calculated Per Acre Price
49	Bush Hogging	Per Acre	linear foot	\$0.25	\$208.75
50	Growth Retardant Spraying	Per Acre	linear foot	\$0.15	\$125.25
53	Brush & Vegetation Clearing	Per Acre	linear foot	\$0.12	\$100.20

11. K2R was requested to provide a clarification for Items 44 – 48 by providing the unit of measure used to calculate the Bid Price. They responded by providing new pricing which is the Bid Price divided by largest diameter inch per line item. Example: \$65 divided by 24 = \$2.71. The unrequested submittal of new pricing for stump grinding appears to indicate that the unit of measure of the price bid was per stump not per inch as requested.

Item No.	Description	UOM on ITB	Response to Request for Clarification UOM Used on Bid	Bid Price
44	Stump Grinding – 13” to 24” (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$2.71	\$65.00

45	Stump Grinding – 25” to 36” (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$3.47	\$125.00
46	Stump Grinding – 27” to 48” (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$ 3.85	\$185.00
47	Stump Grinding – 49” to 60” (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$4.07	\$245.00
48	Stump Grinding – 61” or Greater (Diameter)	Per Inch.	\$5.00	\$305.00

12. After thorough review, it is recommended that Items 43 – 50, 53 and 54 be removed from consideration of award, as these items are included in the other line items for tree removal w/stump grinding and tree removal with root ball removal. It is further recommended that the remaining items be awarded equally among the responsive and responsible bidders. When a need arises, the County (user departments) will obtain quotes from all three (3) bidders and award the work based on lowest cost and the vendor’s availability to perform the work.